

IRG N2209 version 2

Title: Error Report: H/T glyphs for 嶼 (U+5DD5) and 嶼 (U+5284)

Author: Henry Chan

Source: Eiso Chan, Henry Chan

Type: Individual Contribution to IRG #48 and UTC

Date: 2017/06/11

Issue 1

Current Code Charts U+5DD5:

5DD5 山 46.19	嶼	嶼	嶼
	GE-286B	HB2-F6DD	T2-6D4B

子 and 女 cannot be unified.

Glyph in SuperCJK v14:

05DD5 13258 13258 0323.061 10809.011 山 19	GE-286B T2-6D4B	嶼 嶼
---	--------------------	--------

If Taiwan prefers the form with 子, T2-6D4B should be moved to U+21FD2 instead.

21FD2 山 46.20	嶼	嶼
	UCS2003	G4K

Possible Action Items

- 1) Restore the HK glyph to the 女 version;
- 2) Either:
 - i. Restore the TW glyph to the 女 version; or
 - ii. Remap T2-6D4B to U+21FD2

Issue 2

Current Code Charts U+5284:

5284
刀 18.12

劊 GE-2344 筩 HB2-E35A 筩 T2-4C61 劊 J4-233D 劊 V1-4D34

The difference in structure is not unifiable.

Glyph in SuperCJK v14:

05284 03437 03437 0144.261 10356.030 刀 12	GE-2344 T2-4C61 V1-4D34	劊 劊
---	-----------------------------------	--------

If Taiwan prefers the form with expanded 竹, T2-4C61 should be re-assigned to 筩 (U+7B9A) instead.

7B9A
竹 118.8

筩 G5-6353 筩 J0-6434 筩 K0-7330 筩 V2-8E52

Possible Action Items

- 1) Restore the HK glyph to the left/right structure version;
- 2) Either:
 - i. Restore the TW glyph to the left/right structure version; or
 - ii. Remap T2-4C61 to U+7B9A

Past Cases

- It was discovered in U+7921 礪, an extra 礪 had been added to the H/T glyphs, making it the same shape as U+7934 礪.

IRG decided that the glyph for U+7921 had to be reverted. No source mappings were changed.

- It was discovered in Extension B multiple glyphs had been changed in later versions of CNS11643. The changed glyph was left as is:

	The source glyph for T7-2F4B should have been unified with 24381 𤇀 but was allocated here by a mistake. The UCS2003 glyph for this code point should have been based on T7-2F4B but showed different shape by a mistake. For consistency with TCA CNS standards, 243BE's source reference to T7-2F4B is kept as in this International Standard.
	The glyph of TF-686D in TCA CNS standard has been changed after the original publication of CJK UNIFIED IDEOGRAPHS EXTENSION B in ISO/IEC 10646. For consistency with TCA CNS standard, TF-686D glyph needs to be as in this International Standard, although the glyph is not usually unified with UCS2003 glyph of this code point.
	The glyph of T5-7C22 in TCA CNS standard has been changed after the original publication of CJK UNIFIED IDEOGRAPHS EXTENSION B in ISO/IEC 10646. For consistency with TCA CNS standard, T5-7C22 glyph needs to be as in this International Standard, although the glyph is not usually unified with GHZ-74512.13 glyph and/or UCS2003 glyph of this code point.

Note: for these three cases, the change in glyph did not cause it to be duplicated with another character, thus it is prudent to be “left as-is”.

Comments

If the representative glyph is reverted, it does not necessarily ensure the integrity of the ISO10646, as font vendors generally reference the national standards for the glyph shape. Unless the national standards are changed in sync with ISO10646, and the fonts are updated speedily, the integrity of ISO10646 is compromised.

In other parts of Extension B, multiple single-source T-source glyphs have been changed (beyond unifiable variation) in the national standards without synchronization of the glyph shape in ISO10646 (refer to IRGN2131). In such conflict, the font vendors often choose to follow the national standards. This harms the portability of ISO10646 across locales.

It may be considered that the integrity of abstract glyph shape specified in ISO10646 be considered a higher priority than mapping compatibility with national standards. Otherwise, ISO10646 will be destabilized by short-sighted changes in the national standards.