SAT Response to Consolidated Comments on IRG Working Set 2015 Version 4.0 (IRGN2223)

1. Unification

00132 USAT06168	兂 U+4EA2	4EA2 亠 8.2　兂 G0-3F3A　兂 HB1-A4AE　兂 T1-446D　兂 J0-5036　兂 K0-7971　兂 V1-4A5B	As MJ006465 (with same glyph shape, see IRGN2146 suzuki feedback 2), this should be unified to U+4EA2.	J

Need discussion. We could not find rationale to unify in UCV, and cannot decide whether unifiable under WS2015 rules.

00282 USAT08988	肭 U+808F	808F 肉 130.2　肭 G3-305B　肭 HB2-CDAB　肭 T2-284B	Unifiable to U+808F.	J

They are non-cognate. 00282 is cognate with U+43CC 𠵀.

00421 USAT09443	勽 U+52FD	52FD 勹 20.2　勽 G5-332B　勽 T3-2155	Both of USAT09443 and 勽(U+52FD) are found in 一切経音義, but difficult to understand whether they are semantically interchangeable or differently used.	J

They are likely non-cognate. 00421 seems to be cognate with U+26951 𦥑.

00448 USAT10620	卒 U+20993	20993 十 24.5　卒 UCS2003　卒 GKX-0156.25　卒 T6-263A	Maybe non-cognate but minor stroke difference from 卒 (U+20993). U+20993 seems not to be used in SAT DB.	J

They are non-cognate. 00448 should rhyme with U+54FD 哽, while U+20993 is cognate with 丕.

00474 USAT09908	印 U+5370	5370 卩 26.4　印 G0-5321　印 HB1-A64C　印 T1-474D　印 J0-3075　印 K0-6C54　印 V1-4D75	Minor stroke difference from 印(U+5370)	J

Agree to unify.

01129	庰 USAT09620	U+5E98	5E98 广 53.4	庰 G3-3A42	庰 T3-2865	庰 K2-3054	Maybe minor stroke difference from 庰(U+5E98)	J

Need discussion. 01129 is used instead of U+5EBE 庾 as well as U+5E98.

01180	彁 USAT06432	U+22416	22416 弓 57.11	彁 UCS2003	彁 GKX-0360.38	彁 T6-5C59	Unifiable to 彁(U+22416)	J

Need discussion. We could not find rationale to unify in UCV, and cannot decide whether unifiable under WS2015 rules.

01188	彤 USAT09644	U+22488	22488 彡 59.4	彤 UCS2003	彤 GHZ-20853.01	彤 T6-2754	Maybe unifiable to 彤(u+22488)	J

Need discussion. We could not find rationale to unify in UCV, and cannot decide whether unifiable under WS2015 rules.

01492	攷 USAT09808	U+06537	攷	Unifiable to 攷(U+06537) as IVD?.	K

Non-unifiable. Unification of these two shapes is prohibited by current NUC #405.

01536	放 USAT06520	U+0653E	放	Unifiable to 放(U+0653E) as IVD?.	K

Non-unifiable. Unification of these two shapes is prohibited by current NUC #405.

01499 USAT06694	U+0655E	敞	Unifiable to 敞(U+0655E) as IVD?. See 《中華字海(zhonghuazihai)》 p.876.	K

Non-unifiable. Unification of these two shapes is prohibited by current NUC #405.

01677 USAT10587	U+04F86	來	Unifiable to 來(U+04F86) as IVD?. See 《中華字海(zhonghuazihai)》 p.745.	K

Need discussion. We could not find evidence whether 01677 is cognate with U+4F86.

03377 USAT05241	U+26536	26536 耳 128.2 耴 UCS2003 耴 GHZ-42784.04	Unifiable to U+26536, UCV#123	J

Agree to unify.

2. IDSes, radicals

01489	巡 USAT09839 65 支 □支巛 3	7		Would it be more appropriate to change the IDS to □支巛?	H

Agree to change.

03419	胇 USAT06375	IDS	Change IDS from □肉市 to □肉巿	UTC

No objection.

04081	跂 USAT07168	IDS	Change IDS from □足攴 to □⻊攴	UTC

No objection.

04089	跚 USAT08929	IDS	Change IDS from □足刖 to □⻊刖	UTC

No objection.

04109	蹴 USAT08867	IDS	Change IDS from ⿰足畓 to ⿰𧾷畓	UTC

No objection.

04114	蹲 USAT09253	IDS	Change IDS from ⿰足弅 to ⿰𧾷弅	UTC

No objection.

04131	蹳 USAT09022	IDS	Change IDS from ⿰足疑 to ⿰𧾷疑	UTC

No objection.

05266 (SAT)	鸄 USAT09827	IDS	IDS should be "⿱⿲山里灬鳥".	Eiso

Agree to change, but we prefer ⿱⿰山黒鳥.

03833	 USAT08338	Indexing Radical	UTC: Change Radical to #18 刀 or #74 月, or at least add additional kRSUnicode value(s): 18.4 and/or 74.2 T: Change Radical to #18 刀 or #74 月.	UTC, T

It must be an editorial error that the character currently has Radical #18, as we see the radical change is "Not accepted" in IRG48 discussion record (IRGN2217 Appendix 1). We request the radical back to #148 角.

01086 (SAT)	 USAT07220	radical, SC	The radical of 嘗 (U+29810) is 首, so the radical should be changed to "185 首", SC should be "8", FS should be 1.	Eiso

Agree to change.

01139 (SAT)	 USAT05879	radical	The evidence shows "USAT05879……徒即反顧野王云唐從庚字書云虛也說文從庚從口……" Compare with 說文解字 & 康熙字典, we could found out "徒即反" should be corrected to "徒郎反". USAT05879 is the variant form of 唐, so the radical should be changed to "30 口", FS should be 4.	Eiso

Agree to change.

01153 (SAT)	 USAT06491	radical	The evidence shows "……次……羨延反說文云次口液也從水欠聲或作USAT06491古字也經作涎變古字易左爲右也", so we can confirm USAT06491 is the variant form of 次 & 涎. The radical should be changed to "85 水", FS should 3.	Eiso

Agree to change.

01338 (SAT)	 USAT09356	radical, SC	The evidence shows "說文USAT09356頭也", so we can confirm it is the variant form of 顗. The radical should be changed to "181 頁", SC should be "4", FS should be 1.	Eiso

Agree to change.

01642 (SAT) 朋 USAT05873	radical	The evidence shows "......USAT05873......洛管反說文云凡物無乳者卵生也古文作 卝......", so this character is the variant form of 卵. The better radical is "130 肉".	Eiso

Need discussion. Not obviously clear that it should belong to Radical 130.

01646 (SAT) 朓 USAT09486	radical	The evidence shows "......腒巨魚反鄭注周禮腒乾雉也說文北方謂鳥腊音昔曰腒從 月居聲集從爽作USAT09486字書無此字也", so we can confirm USAT09486 is the variant of 腒, and the radical of 腒 is 肉. We can clear the radical which the evidence point out is 月(U+2EBC) not 月(U+6708), so the better radical is "130 肉".	Eiso

Agree to change.

01648 (SAT) 胯 USAT06769	radical	The evidence shows "USAT06769......苦卦反經作胯俗字也......", so we can confirm USAT06769 is the variant form of 胯. The radical should be changed to "130 肉".	Eiso

Agree to change.

01658 (SAT) 縢 USAT06929	radical	The evidence shows "縢......朴那反集訓云縢肛滿脹大皃也坤蒼縢亦脹也古今正字 作胖亦作USAT06929 USAT06929肛腸脹也從肉夆聲肛音戶公反......". Compare with 漢大 v2 and 龍龕, "朴那反" should be corrected to "朴邦反", which the original 反切上字 on 龍龕 is 普, but the initials of 朴 and 普 are both 滂 in Middle Chinese. So we can confirm USAT06929 is the variant form of 縢 & 胖, and the evidence had told us the radical is 肉. The radical should be changed to "130 肉".	Eiso

Agree to change.

01659 (SAT) 腭 USAT07094	radical	The evidence shows "USAT07093昂各反......斷也說文作𦠍......", so we can confirm USAT07093 is the variant form of 㹷 (U+2680D). The radical should be changed to "130 肉".	Eiso

Agree to change.

01661 (SAT)	勝 USAT10197	radical	The evidence shows "腕……古文作USAT10197鄭注儀云掌節也……", so we can confirm USAT10197 is the variant form of 腕 and the meaning is about human's organs. The radical should be changed to "130 肉".	Eiso

Agree to change.

02330 (SAT)	樊 USAT10180	radical, SC	The evidence shows "樊……音煩……説文云驚不行也從爻從林從大聲也又音攀或作USAT10180一也" which the original text from 説文 is "驚不行也从叽从棥棥亦聲" and some scholars thought 驚 should be corrected to "驚" (段玉裁) or "繁" (李守奎). We can confirm USAT10180 is the variant form of 樊. The radical of 樊 on Kangxi Dictionary and current Unicode is 木, but I think the best radical of USAT10180 is 廾. 説文 shows the radical is 叽 which means 反収 (aka 廾), so we can choose 廾 as the radical. The radical should be changed to "55 廾", SC should be "12", FS should be 1.	Eiso

Disagree. U+24569 樊 belongs to Radical 89, so should 02330.

03439 (SAT)	腺 USAT05049	radical	The evidence shows USAT05049 is the variant form of 弞. This left component 月 is the imprecise form of 弓, which is included to the miscellaneous department of the Radical 月. The radical should be changed to "74 月".	SAT

Agree to change.

03994 (SAT)	彩 USAT05573	radical, SC	The evidence shows "鳳……許慎説文云神鳥也出東方君子之國翱翔四海之外龍文龜背鴛頷雞喙五USAT05573備舉非梧桐不棲非竹實不食……". Compare with the other version of 説文, "五USAT05573備舉" means "五色備舉", and 色彩互訓. "五彩備舉" is an idiom described phoenix (鳳凰). So we can confirm USAT05573 is the variant form of 彩. The radical should be changed to "59 彡", SC should be "7", FS should be 3.	SAT

Agree to change.

3. Glyphs / Fonts

01109 USAT04273	帥	Normalization	The right hand side is better normalized as 市 instead of 巿, 巿 itself is similar in meaning to 巾.	Henry

We will correct the glyph.

02820 USAT06977	矬	Normalization	坙, the exact glyph the right hand side, is a variant of 埊. In this case, the right hand side "坙" is actually "坙 (U+212F2)", which is a variant form of 坐. To avoid confusion, it is suggested that the character be normalized to use 坙 (U+212F2) instead of 坙. Alternatively, unify to 矬 (U+77EC) via IVD.	Henry

Disagree. We cannot be untrue to the original shape.

03419 USAT06375	肺	Structure	Change 巿 (5 strokes) to 市 (4 strokes) in glyph	UTC

We will correct the glyph.

4. Stroke counts and total strokes

01109 USAT04273	帥	SC=8 (the vertical stroke of the right part of the proposed glyph in the evidence file seems to be disconnected)	J	8 11

The stroke count is correct while the glyph is erroneous (see above).

03470	臉寬 USAT90298	SC	Change SC from 13 to 14	TCA	14 20

Agree to change.

03833	肙 USAT08338	SC	Change SC from 0 to 2 or 4	TCA	0 6

The stroke count is correct while the radical is erroneous (see above).

04187 (SAT)	緣 USAT05679	SC	SC should be "19". **Note**: The evidence shows "USAT05679……兵媚反說文云馬 USAT05679 也詩云六 USAT05679 如絲從絲從惠……". Compare with 說文, we can confirm USAT05679 is the variant form of 彎, The radical of 彎 on Kangxi Dictionary is 車, but the better radical is 糸 according to 說文.	Eiso	22

We could not correctly understand the intention of the comment. The commenter expects radical 山?

04434 (SAT)	鏈 USAT08427	SC, TS	SC should be "10", TS should be "18".	Eiso	10 18

Agree to change.

01678	柔 75 木 □牙木 USAT90070 4 9	TS	TS=8		HK	8

Agree to change.

03419	胇 USAT06375	TS	Change TS from 11 to 10		UTC, TCA	10

Agree to change.

03426	牰 130 肉 □肉牟 USAT06768 7 13	SC, TS	SC=6, TS=12　2　3404牛牛　③　牛₃ 牛₄ IRGN2221 #2:		HK	12

Agree to change.

03470	牰 USAT90298	TS	Change TS from 19 to 20		TCA	20

Agree to change.

03521	舿 USAT10046	TS	Change TS from 15 to 15,14		UTC	15

Agree to change.

03541	芊 USAT09033	TS	Change TS from 5 to 6,5 T: 6	UTC, TCA	6

Agree to change.

03557	芛 USAT90299 芛 UTC-02629	TS	Change TS from 7,8 to 8,7	UTC, TCA	8

Agree to change.

03620	薯 USAT09488	TS	Change TS from 12 to 13,12	UTC, TCA	13

Agree to change.

03627	蕃 USAT06928	TS	UTC: Change TS from 13 to 14,13 HK: TS=14 IRGN954AR #36:	UTC, TCA	14

Agree to change.

03635	揩 USAT09005	TS	Change TS from 14 to 15,14	UTC, TCA	15

Agree to change.

03640	蔮 USAT08414	TS	Change TS from 14 to 15,14	UTC, TCA	15

Agree to change.

03645	蕱 USAT09183	TS	Change TS from 15 to 16,15	UTC, TCA	16

Agree to change.

03675	藤 USAT06065	TS	Change TS from 20 to 21,20	UTC, TCA	21

Agree to change.

03792	袄 USAT06913	TS	Change TS from 13 to 13,12	UTC	14

Agree to change.

03879	謤 USAT05081	TS	Change TS from 21 to 21,20	UTC	21

Agree to change.

04303	遍 USAT08848	TS	Change TS from 15 to 15,14	UTC	15

Agree to change.

05096 (G)	鮮 GHZR84996. 07 鮮 USAT10123	TS	TS should be "18".	Eiso, G	18

Agree to change.