

Title: Feedback to Henry Chan for feedback to IRGN2647

Author: Night Koo

Date: 2023-10-29

ㄥ 31C8	HZWG	héng-zhé-wān-gōu	橫折彎鉤	ㄥ
九4E5D, 几51E0, 飞98DE, 风98CE, 气6C14, 虱8671, 瘋760B				
乙 31E0	HXWG	héng-xié-wān-gōu	橫斜彎鉤	
乙4E59, 𠃉6C39, 乞4E5E				

Current information on unification in [Appendix F: Documentation of CJK Strokes](#) related to stroke **HZXG** and relatives (HZWG/HXWG)

This is a response to Henry Chan’s “Feedback to ‘IRGN2647 Proposal to disunify two strokes in CJK’” submitted on 2023-10-16. I will suggest UTC to continue to encode CJK STROKE HZXG ㄥ (橫折斜鉤). The reasons are as follow.

The CJK Strokes in range U+31C0..U+31CF is first proposed through [L2/04-263](#) as part of the HKSCS extension. The current U+31C8 CJK STROKE HZWG ㄥ is encoded in HKSCS as 0x884D with the current glyph as shown in the Code Charts. Below shows the glyphs of U+31C8 in past and current HKSCS documents.

		884C ㄥ F30F F30F 21FE8			31C7 ㄥ H-884A
C	ㄥ F30F F30F	884D ㄥ F310 F310 F310	31C8 ㄥ F310 F310 (884D)	31C8 ㄥ F310 [F310] (884D)	31C8 ㄥ H-884D
D	ㄥ F310 F310	884E ㄥ F311 F311 200CA	31C9 ㄥ F312 F312 (884F)	31C9 ㄥ F312 [F312] (884F)	31C9 ㄥ H-884F
E	ㄥ F311 F311				

0x884D in versions of HKSCS, from left to right: 1999, 2001, 2004, 2008, latest 2016.

This glyph shape is stable throughout the encoding process. Thus, the suggestion to change the glyph of U+31C8 from HZWG 𠃉 to HZXG 𠃉 will break backwards-compatibility with HKSCS and previous versions of Unicode.

It is also noted that the proposed stroke HZXG 𠃉 has a similar shape at U+2E84 CJK RADICAL SECOND THREE 𠃉. However, the proposed stroke HZXG 𠃉 is not unifiable with U+2E84 due to following considerations:

1. U+2E84 is considered a variant of Kangxi Radical 5 乙 (which can be considered as stroke HXWG 乙) in the chart annotation, which is opposite of the mapping as shown in GF 2001-2001.

2E84 𠃉 CJK RADICAL SECOND THREE
 • variant of Kangxi Radical 5
 → 4E59 乙

Annotation in [Code Charts of CJK Radicals Supplement](#)

折	5.12	横折竖折横	横折折	𠃉	凹 𠃉
	5.13	横折竖弯横	横折弯	𠃉	朵
	5.14	横折竖折提	横折提	𠃉	计 颞 鸪
	5.15	横折竖钩	横折钩	𠃉 (フ)	同 门 却 永 耍 万 母 仓 / 也
	5.16	横折捺钩	横斜钩 (俗称)	𠃉	飞 风 执
	5.17	竖折横折竖	竖折折	𠃉	鼎 𠃉 亞 吳
	5.18	竖折横折撇	竖折撇	𠃉 (フ、フ)	专 / 隼 / 矢
	5.19	竖弯横钩	竖弯钩	𠃉	己 匕 电 心
折	5.20	横折竖折横折竖	横折折折	𠃉	凸
	5.21	横折竖折横折撇	横折折撇	𠃉	及 延
	5.22	横折竖弯横钩	横折弯钩	𠃉 (乙)	几 丸 / 艺 亿
	5.23	横折撇折弯竖钩	横撇弯钩 (俗称)	𠃉	阳 部
	5.24	竖折横折竖钩	竖折折钩	𠃉 (フ)	马 与 钙 / 号 弓
4 折	5.25	横折竖折横折竖钩	横折折折钩	𠃉 (フ)	乃 / 杨

GF 2001-2001

2. U+2E84 has the property *Radicals* in the Unicode Character Database, while the proposed CJK STROKE HZXG 𠃉 should not have the property *Radicals*; instead it should have the same properties as other CJK strokes in U+31C0..31E3.
3. U+2E84 is separately defined in HKSCS at 0xC8D7, which shows that the HKSCS treats HZWG 𠃉 and HZXG 𠃉 as different characters (or strokes), and changing the glyph of U+31C8/0x884D from HZWG 𠃉 to HZXG 𠃉 will make 0x884D and 0xC8D7 have equivalent shape in HKSCS, breaking compatibility.

It is possible to change the mapping of 0xC8D7 in HKSCS to the newly proposed CJK STROKE HZXG 𠃉, however as the range of 0xC8D6-0xC8F1 in HKSCS are clearly related to the CJK radicals, it is unadvisable to change the mapping of 0xC8D7 in HKSCS, which will also break backward-compatibility. There is also no apparent benefit of changing the mapping in HKSCS.

					2E80 𠃉 2E80 F820 (C8D6)	2E80 𠃉 2E80 [F820] (C8D6)	2E80 𠃉 H-C8D6
𠃉 F820 2E80	𠃉 F830 2EB6	C8D7 𠃉 F821 2E84 2E84	C8E1 𠃉 F82B 2EA5 2EA5	C8EB 𠃉 F835 2ECC 2ECC	2E84 𠃉 2E84 F821 (C8D7)	2E84 𠃉 2E84 [F821] (C8D7)	2E84 𠃉 H-C8D7
𠃉 F821 2E84	𠃉 F831 2EBC	C8D8 𠃉 F822 2E86 2E86	C8E2 𠃉 F82C 2EA7 2EA7	C8EC 𠃉 F836 2ECD 2ECD	2E86 𠃉 2E86 F822 (C8D8)	2E86 𠃉 2E86 [F822] (C8D8)	2E86 𠃉 H-C8D8
𠃉 F822 2E86	𠃉 F832 2EBE						

U+2E84 in versions of HKSCS, from left to right: 1999, 2001, 2004, 2008, latest 2016. All have clearly shown 0xC8D7 is grouped with other radical variants.

There are also two other stroke characters separately encoded in the CJK Radicals Supplement, which are U+2E82 CJK RADICAL SECOND ONE 𠃊 and U+2E83 CJK RADICAL SECOND TWO 𠃋, corresponding to U+31D6 CJK STROKE HG 𠃊 and U+31DF CJK STROKE SWG 𠃋 respectively. Thus, the encoding of U+2E84 should not affect the proposed encoding of CJK STROKE HZXG 𠃉.

That is all.