

IRGN2632 Discussion of the unification between 殼 and 殼 (UCV #312d)

IRG #62

Author: Henry Chan

Date: 2024-03-19

In 02417, 殼 (GKJ-00628) was unified to #59, so to be consistent,

03165 殼 (SAT-06015) should be unified to

2483C
犬 94.11

殼

UCS2003

殼

GKX-0717.16

殼

T7-2529

in IRG

263BC
羊 123.11

殼

UCS2003

殼

GKX-0954.04

殼

T7-3A52

A unification rule was created as of the unification for 02417:

312d unifiable	 ☐殼☐☐殼☐☐殼☐ Discussion https://hc.jsecs.org/irg/ws2021/app/index.php?id=02417 Rule Application Rate: N/A
-------------------	---

Issue 1

Objection to the unification rule was raised in comments for WS2021 v5.0 and v6.0 saying it was not in-line with established precedence.

The cited examples of established precedence came mostly from Extension B, where during that time, inclusion of a character as a character head in an authoritative dictionary was treated, for the purposes of IRG, as non-cognate. This principle no longer applies hence Extension B dis-unification examples cannot be used as a valid example for prior dis-unification.

There are also no dis-unification examples in URO.

In all existing cases, per Kushim's comment #14290, they are variants, and the form with 殼 is the canonical form.

This is inherently no different from other UCVs where a single third level component has been changed into a different form. In fact most of the other UCVs involve second level components and not third level components.

The fact that these two components can act as separate phonetic elements is already covered by the UCV classification level 2.

The second objection was that the filing of this UCV as "differences in relative length of strokes" (j-2). This can be easily solved by putting it in the correct category "Unification of similar shapes" (j-3).

Issue 2

During the meeting, Wang Yi Fan raised the issue that the UCV created did not actually match the unification.

Confusion seems to have arisen because the UCV was suggested based on the suggestion to unify to 殼 U+3E89 (𠂇殼犬), but the discussion record marked it was unified to 𪔓 U+2483C (𠂇殼犬).

Solutions

Either:

Solution 1: Change UCV rule #312d to match the unification result of 02417:

𪔓 𪔓 𪔓
𠂇 𠂇 𠂇

keep 𪔓 (GKJ-00628, 02417) unified to

2483C 𪔓 𪔓 𪔓
犬 94.11 UCS2003 GKX-0717.16 T7-2529

unify 𪔓 (SAT-06015, 03165) to

263BC 𪔓 𪔓 𪔓
羊 123.11 UCS2003 GKX-0954.04 T7-3A52

or

Solution 2: Keep the UCV #312d as is:

𪔓 𪔓 𪔓
𠂇 𠂇 𠂇

unify 𪔓 (GKJ-00628, 02417) to

3E89 𪔓 𪔓
犬 94.10 G3-4F32 T4-4466

unify 𪔓 (SAT-06015, 03165) to

263AF 𪔓 𪔓 𪔓
羊 123.10 UCS2003 GKX-0953.34 T5-5721

instead and

Note the canonical form given by Shuowenjiezi is the form with 𪔓. The variants using the components 𠂇 and 𠂇 are variants which may be considered "improper" or "vulgar" by some sources.