




SAT Feedback to “Request to add seven new UCVs” (IRGN2675)

Date: 2024-03-20

Regarding the proposed UCV No. 1 in IRGN2675:

| 1 | 2 | 3 |
|---|---|---|
|  |  |  |
| U+7559 | U+7571 | U+24CA2 |
| GHTJKPV | GTJKPV | T |

We believe that the glyph No. 1 and glyphs No. 2-3 (or, by extension, 留/畱 derived shapes) should not be made unifiable in principle.

The origin of the character 畱 can be traced back to 說文解字: “畱：止也。从田、卯聲。”, where 說文解字 also state that 卯 is an older variant of 酉¹, different from 卯, which is original shape of 卯².

However, modern scholars generally believe that the ancestor of this character had always been attested with 卯 at the top in pre-Qin usage, and the glyph that has 卯 is an artifact introduced by 說文解字. Be noted though, that 留 is originally for a proper name at Oracle or Bronze script ages, and was rarely used in the current meaning until the Seal script stage, rather than being borrowed to write what are now 劉, 瘤, 流, etc.

Nevertheless, under the prestigious influence of 說文解字, 畱 (with its derivatives) has been received as the “canonical” shape of 留 for most of the history down to the Kangxi dictionary. Intellectuals do not only use 畱 as an “inkhorn” glyph interchangeably with 留, but sometimes

¹ 古文酉，从卯。卯爲春門，萬物已出。卯爲秋門，萬物已入。

² 卯本字。與卯字上畫連者有別。卯音酉。

intentionally contrasted with 留 (see the picture).

畱
也 止
從田 𠄎聲 臣錯曰
田猶土也 里由反

𠄎
古文酉 從𠄎 𠄎為春門 萬物已出 𠄎為秋門 萬物已入 從一 中閉門象也

𠄎
冒也 二月萬物冒地而出 象開門之形 故二月為天門 凡𠄎之屬皆從𠄎 臣錯曰 二月陰不能制陽 陽冒

字作眠 目冥也
從目 民聲也
稽
畱
上經 覓反 考聲 云稽滯也 說文 畱止也 從
𠄎 統聲 統音雞 古文作
訓與前同 考聲 久也 說文 田也 從田 𠄎聲 今
經文 變體作留 或作留 又作
畱 展轉訛也 𠄎音酉 亦音柳
謝
法
上夕
夜反

With above, an important and also complicating factor with regard to UCV here is that 說文解字 did actually alter the phonetic component. It is thought that 卯 had pronunciation **mru²* and 酉 **lu²* in the Old Chinese (i.e. around the time of 詩經), and they were eligible to 通假 (i.e. being options to be the phonetic indicator of the same word). Given that 說文解字 continues to use 卯 for 柳 or 聊, reanalysis of 留 as 𠂔卯田 by 說文解字 strongly suggests that the phonetic system at 許慎 Xu Shen's period no more favors 卯 for 留's pronunciation as much as 酉. The fact effectively establishes 畱 a variant with alternative component (異構字) rather than a pure orthographic variant (異寫字) of 留, similar to what 綫 is to 線, or 仙 to 僊.

As far as we find, the current UCV list has few entries exhibiting a similar circumstance. Most are either difference in:

- component(s) which do not carry semantic or phonetic role; or
- component(s) whose cognacy with whichever option is unambiguous if the context given

However, of course, difference in a component which does not contribute to semantic distinction in isolation is not automatically marked as unification candidate, because we also recognize the principle of difference in actual component not to be unified. What we find could be counted as precedents of 留/畱 case might be UCV #183 (每/每) and NUCV #294 (麻/麻), but the former is largely resulted from how late the 毋/母 distinction is fixated; and the latter is more related to simplified vs. traditional distinction. Moreover, in any case, 留/畱 retains quite dissimilar shapes in modern style as well as parallel usage until relatively recent times.

And as a tangential discussion, we think we should be more careful of pressing forward criteria solely based on holistic similarities, which could be in turn superficial. As far as I can remember, we have been already experienced several pitfalls in controversial cases such as [WS2021-02899 \(𠂔↔总\)](#), [WS2021-01842 \(𠂔𠂔木\)](#), [WS2015-03555 \(𠂔++仑\)](#), etc.

(End of document)

³ Also **N-ru²* according to Baxter and Sagart.